



Markets Committee

Date: WEDNESDAY, 4 MARCH 2015
Time: 11.30 am
Venue: COMMITTEE ROOMS, 2ND FLOOR, WEST WING, GUILDHALL

Members:

John Scott (Chairman)	Deputy Keith Knowles
Hugh Morris (Deputy Chairman)	Edward Lord
Alex Bain-Stewart	Professor John Lumley
Nicholas Bensted-Smith	Wendy Mead
Christopher Boden	Robert Merrett
Alderman Charles Bowman	Deputy Joyce Nash
Revd Dr William Campbell-Taylor	Graham Packham
Deputy John Chapman	Chris Punter
Karina Dostalova	Adam Richardson
Deputy Stanley Ginsburg	Elizabeth Rogula
Alderman Timothy Hailes	Ian Seaton
Brian Harris	Deputy Dr Giles Shilson
Christopher Hayward	Angela Starling
Tom Hoffman	Patrick Streeter
Michael Hudson	James Tumbridge
Jamie Ingham Clark	Mark Wheatley
Deputy Alastair King	

Enquiries: Chris Bartson-Umuliisa
tel. no.: 020 7332 1408
Chris.Bartson-Umuliisa@cityoflondon.gov.uk

Lunch will be served in Guildhall Club at 1PM
NB: Part of this meeting could be the subject of audio or video recording

John Barradell
Town Clerk and Chief Executive

AGENDA

Part 1 - Public Agenda

1. **APOLOGIES**
2. **MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**
3. **PUBLIC MINUTES**
To agree the public minutes of the meeting held on 28th January 2015.
For Decision
(Pages 1 - 8)
4. **TERMS OF REFERENCE**
To consider the terms of reference of the Markets Committee.
For Decision
(Pages 9 - 10)
5. **ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITY AT SMITHFIELD MARKET**
Report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection
For Information
(Pages 11 - 20)
6. **SMITHFIELD MARKET - CONDENSER WATER COOLING SYSTEM - UPDATE**
Report of the City Surveyor
For Information
(Pages 21 - 26)
7. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**
8. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**
9. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**
MOTION - That under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

Part 2 - Non-Public Agenda

10. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**
To agree the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 28th January 2015
For Decision
(Pages 27 - 30)

11. **CONCESSIONARY PARKING AT SMITHFIELD MARKET DURING THE EASTER PERIOD 2015**
Report of the Superintendent at Smithfield Market

For Decision
(Pages 31 - 34)
12. **NON PUBLIC APPENDIX TO THE 'SMITHFIELD WATER CONDENSER COOLING SYSTEM – UPDATE'**
Non-public appendices to be considered in conjunction with Item No.6.

For Information
(Pages 35 - 38)
13. **POULTRY MARKET ROOF - UPDATE**
Briefing note and presentation of the City Surveyor.

For Information
(Pages 39 - 44)
14. **NON PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**
15. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

This page is intentionally left blank

MARKETS COMMITTEE

Wednesday, 28 January 2015

Minutes of the meeting of the Markets Committee held at Committee Rooms, 2nd Floor, West Wing, Guildhall on Wednesday, 28 January 2015 at 11.30 am

Present

Members:

John Scott (Chairman)	Michael Hudson
Hugh Morris (Deputy Chairman)	Edward Lord
Alex Bain-Stewart	Professor John Lumley
Nicholas Bensted-Smith	Wendy Mead
Revd Dr William Campbell-Taylor	Deputy Joyce Nash
Deputy John Chapman	Graham Packham
Karina Dostalova	Adam Richardson
Deputy Stanley Ginsburg	Deputy Dr Giles Shilson
Alderman Timothy Hailes	Angela Starling
Brian Harris	James Tumbridge
Tom Hoffman	Mark Wheatley

In Attendance

Officers:

Huw Rhys Lewis	Director of Property Projects Group, City Surveyor's Department
Andrew Crafter	City Surveyor's Department
Steven Chandler	City Surveyor's Department
Caroline Al-Beyerty	Financial Services Director, Chamberlain's Department
Debbie Howard	Chamberlain's Department
Julie Smith	Chamberlain's Department
Paul Hickson	Comptroller & City Solicitor's
David Smith	Director of Markets & Consumer Protection
Malcolm Macleod	Superintendent, Billingsgate Market
Nigel Shepherd	Superintendent, Spitalfields Market
Donald Perry	Markets & Consumer Protection Department
Kay English	Department of the Built Environment
Julie Zhu	Public Relations Office
Gregory Moore	Town Clerk's Department

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Christopher Boden, Alderman Charles Bowman, Christopher Hayward, Elizabeth Rogula and Ian Seaton.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations.

3. PUBLIC MINUTES

The public minutes of the meeting held on 26 November 2014 were approved as a correct record, subject to the following amendments:

- That minute 7 be amended to include the word 'hours' between '35' and 'a week'
- That Adam Richardson be added to the list of Members having been present.

4. MARKETS BUSINESS PLAN UPDATE PERIOD 2 2014/15 (AUGUST - NOVEMBER)

Members received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection providing an update on progress made against the Business Plan of the Markets Department for Period 2 (August-November) of 2014-15.

It was noted that the Director of Markets & Consumer Protection was forecasting a year end underspend position of £193k (10%) for his City Fund and City Cash services.

The Chairman noted that long-term sickness had affected a number of individuals within the Smithfield Market Constabulary but that the situation was now described as manageable; the Director of Markets & Consumer Protection advised that the long-term sickness periods had covered a three month period and the affected individuals had now returned to work. He also confirmed that the usual Constabulary headcount at the market was 19.

In response to a query as to why August and October seemed to see more sickness absence than other months, the Director undertook to consult with his department's HR business partner to see if there were any underlying causes or if this was a normal seasonal trend.

Members also asked for an update on future occupancy at Smithfield Market once vacancies at the Poultry Market had been filled; the Director advised that he would find out what the new occupancy level would be at this point and update Members accordingly.

Members also discussed the efficacy of the charging regime associated with fire safety inspections which had been implemented at Spitalfields Market. The Superintendent advised that the scheme had been received well and witnessed a high level of take up from traders, with only two tenants yet to satisfactorily complete the inspection process.

It was noted that there was a missing full stop in paragraph 4 of the report., It was clarified that any underspends within the Billingsgate and Spitalfields Repair & Repainting Fund were returned to the reserve at the end of the year,

since these were funded by the tenants' service charges. However, those underspends relating to works at Smithfield which fell within the Additional Works Programme managed by the City Surveyor were returned to City's Cash but would normally be 'rolled over' to the following year..

Members discussed the self-surrender waste management process at Spitalfields Market and asked whether it was viable to introduce an intermediary charitable organisation so that some of the waste produce could be used for good causes. The Superintendent noted that such an arrangement already existed between individual traders and local charities, and that he encouraged representatives of such organisations to speak directly with traders, but confirmed that there was not a formal arrangement with an existing organisation that the City of London Corporation was involved with. Following debate, Members asked for legal clarification on what exactly the market could and could not do with the waste surrendered to it, with a view to clarifying what would be possible in terms of future action. The Director of Markets & Consumer Protection and the Spitalfields Superintendent agreed to look into the matter and provide clarity in due course.

In response to Members' questions around filming at the markets, it was noted that the fees received by the markets were determined by a number of factors including the duration and timing of the filming and the inconvenience caused to normal operations. The fees were negotiated individually each time, with the Public Relations Office holding corporate oversight, and were a good source of income generation. The Financial Services Director advised that charging for filming was being looked at as part of the service based review's focus in to income generating activities, as it was felt that it might be possible to further maximise revenue from this area. Following further queries, the Billingsgate Superintendent agreed to update the Committee outside the meeting on specific details regarding two particular filming/photography charges.

Resolved – That the content of the report be noted.

5. SMITHFIELD MARKET CONDENSER WATER COOLING SYSTEM: UPDATE

Members received a report of the City Surveyor providing an update on the performance of Smithfield Markets' Condenser Water Cooling System, which served Tenants' refrigeration equipment, and the works currently being undertaken to improve the system. The report highlighted that the performance of the condenser water cooling system since the last report in November was satisfactory.

The Chairman advised that he had requested that the penultimate paragraph of report summary be amended to note that the proposal to increase the system operating temperature was subject to consultation with the Smithfield Market Tenants Association, to make clear that a consultation process was ongoing.

Resolved – That the content of the report be noted

6. **CHRISTMAS 2014: SMITHFIELD MARKET TRAFFIC MANAGEMENT PLAN UPDATE**

The Committee received a report of the Superintendent of Smithfield Market, updating on the outcome of the Traffic Management Plan at Smithfield Market for the period leading up to Christmas 2014. The Committee agreed that the plan was successful in minimising congestion and was a vast improvement on the previous year.

A Member asked the Director whether the relaxing of parking charges during Christmas 2014 had been shown to improve customer activity at the market. The Director responded by highlighting that it would be difficult and impractical to gather sufficient data to facilitate meaningful analysis and produce an auditable figure. However, anecdotal evidence indicated that the decreased costs had played a factor in encouraging trade at the market; further, the car park had been much busier than normal. The free parking had also meant that the car park barriers could be left open, thereby assisting with traffic flow and the overall traffic management strategy.

In response to a Member's query, the Traffic Manager undertook to provide further clarity as to the training undertaken by car park attendants and any relevant accreditation held.

The Committee noted the reputational benefits of the free parking and the well-implemented traffic plan, and it was agreed that Members should receive an update on the efficacy of the Traffic Management Plan each year.

Resolved – That the report be noted.

7. **REVENUE AND CAPITAL BUDGETS - COMPARISON BETWEEN ORIGINAL 2014/15 AND LATEST APPROVED BUDGET 2014/15**

Members received a joint report of the Chamberlain and Director of Markets and Consumer Protection which had been prepared following a request by Members to receive more detail as to the variances between the original budget for 2014/15 and the latest approved budget, agreed by the Committee at its 26 November 2014 meeting.

The Chairman thanked the Chamberlain for responding to the Committee's concerns, advising that he and the Deputy Chairman had met with the Financial Services Director to agree that all future items which impacted on the budget would now state the individual as well as the cumulative impact, to help Members track movement between budgets.

The Financial Services Director confirmed that the intention of the original report template had been to simplify the way in which information was presented, but noted that this approach had sometimes made it more difficult for Members to track movement of individual items across budgets. As a result, this new version agreed with the Chairman and Deputy Chairman would also be implemented for other Committees, so as to provide consistency and clarity for Members.

Resolved – That the report be noted.

8. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

New Covent Garden

A Member noted that New Covent Garden Market had recently published plans which suggested that it was intending to expand the range of wares currently sold. In response, the Director of Markets & Consumer Protection reassured Members that his department enjoyed a good relationship with New Covent Garden management and had been fully appraised of the plans; he also confirmed that there was no suggestion that New Covent Garden Market had any intention to create a meat or a fish market as part of their redevelopment on a smaller site.

Caterers at Guildhall

A Member advised that she was aware of a catering company engaged in a forthcoming event at Guildhall that did not source produce from the City Markets, asking what could be done to encourage such companies to use Market produce. The Director of Markets & Consumer Protection assured Members that the Remembrancer was diligent in encouraging those companies on the eligible caterers list to source ingredients from the Markets and did so wherever possible.

9. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

West Poultry Avenue

The Deputy Chairman reported back to the Committee on his recent visit to the vaults below West Poultry Avenue, where he had inspected the structure of the vaults so as to gain an understanding as to whether there was scope to alter the usage of the road above.

It was advised that the nature of the vaults was fundamentally different to those on adjoining tunnels, making any works difficult; further, the way in which electrical wiring was secured meant that any works would be extremely time-consuming and, consequently, given the very limited amount of time that work could be conducted within the tunnel, the cost could be prohibitive.

10. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – That under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 3 of Part I of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act as follows:-

Item	Paragraph
11-15	3

11. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**

The non-public minutes of the meeting held on 26 November 2014 were approved as a correct record, subject to one amendment.

12. **WRITE-OFF OF BAD DEBT**

Members considered and agreed a report seeking approval to write-off a bad debt, subject to the concurrence of the Finance Committee, under the provisions of Standing Order 53(1)(c).

Resolved - That the write-off of bad debt detailed in the report be approved.

13. **DEBT ARREARS MARKETS - PERIOD ENDING 31ST DECEMBER 2014**

Members received a report from the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection informing of invoiced income raised and outstanding as of 31 December 2014.

Resolved – That the report be received and its content noted.

14. **TENANCIES AT WILL AND ASSIGNMENTS**

Members received a regular report on Tenancies at Will that have been granted at the City of London's Wholesale Markets and on lease assignments.

Resolved – That the report be received and its content noted.

15. **NON PUBLIC APPENDIX TO THE 'SMITHFIELD WATER CONDENSER COOLING SYSTEM – UPDATE'**

These were the non-public appendices associated with Item No. 5 and were considered in conjunction with that item.

16. **NON PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

There were no questions.

17. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREE SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**

There was one urgent item.

The meeting ended at 12.58 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Chris Bartson-Umuliisa
tel. no.: 020 7332 1408
Chris.Bartson-Umuliisa@cityoflondon.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

<p>WOOLF, Mayor</p>	<p>RESOLVED: That the Court of Common Council holden in the Guildhall of the City of London on Thursday 1st May 2014, doth hereby appoint the following Committee until the first meeting of the Court in April, 2015.</p>
---------------------	---

MARKETS COMMITTEE

1. **Constitution**
A Ward Committee consisting of,
 - two Aldermen nominated by the Court of Aldermen
 - up to 31 Commoners representing each Ward or Side of Ward (two representatives for the Wards with six or more Members regardless of whether the Ward has sides).
2. **Quorum**
The quorum consists of any nine Members.
3. **Membership 2014/15**

ALDERMEN

- 2 Charles Bowman
- 2 Timothy Russell Hailes

COMMONERS

12	Joyce Carruthers Nash, O.B.E., Deputy	Aldersgate
2	John Stuart Penton Lumley, Professor	Aldersgate
7	Hugh Fenton Morris.....	Aldgate
6	Robert Allan Merrett	Bassishaw
1	Jamie Ingham Clark	Billingsgate
13	Stanley Ginsburg J.P., Deputy.....	Bishopsgate
2	Patrick Thomas Streeter.....	Bishopsgate
5	Dr Giles Robert Evelyn Shilson, Deputy	Bread Street
7	Brian Nicholas Harris.....	Bridge and Bridge Without
2	Christopher Michael Hayward.....	Broad Street
11	Stanley Keith Knowles, M.B.E., Deputy	Candlewick
1	Christopher Paul Boden	Castle Baynard
8	Michael Hudson	Castle Baynard
1	Nicholas Bensted-Smith	Cheap
2	Ian Christopher Norman Seaton.....	Cornhill
2	Angela Starling.....	Cripplegate Within
2	Chris Punter	Cripplegate Without
2	Mark Raymond Peter Henry Delano Wheatley	Dowgate
10	Alex Bain-Stewart M.Sc., J.P.....	Farringdon Within
2	Karina Helen Dostalova.....	Farringdon Within
2	Wendy Mead.....	Farringdon Without
2	Charles Edward Lord, O.B.E., J.P.	Farringdon Without
8	John Douglas Chapman, Deputy.....	Langbourn
7	Elizabeth Rogula	Lime Street
1	Revd. William Campbell-Taylor	Portsoken
13	Alastair John Naisbitt King, M.Sc., Deputy.....	Queenhithe
6	James Richard Tumbridge	Tower
5	Tom Hoffman	Vintry

Together with the following Members in place of the three Wards (Coleman Street, Cordwainer and Walbrook) not making appointments on this occasion:-

Graham David Packham
Adam Fox McCloud Richardson
John George Stewart Scott, J.P.

4. **Terms of Reference**
To be responsible for:-

- (a) the management of all matters relating to Smithfield Market, Billingsgate Market and Spitalfields Market and the letting of all premises therein;
- (b) the appointment of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection (in consultation with the Port Health and Environmental Services and Licensing Committees).

Barradell

Committee(s):	Date(s):
Markets Committee	4 March 2015
Subject: Enforcement Activity at Smithfield Market	Public
Report of: Director of Markets & Consumer Protection	For Information

Summary

This report advises your Committee of Enforcement Activity carried out by the Smithfield Enforcement Team within my Department during the four month period 1 October 2014 to 31 January 2015.

It provides information on two successful funding bids to the Food Standards Agency (FSA) in respect of i) the FSA's National Co-ordinated Food Sampling Programme 2014/15 and ii) a food standards and traceability project.

An outline of the guidance and training developed for Smithfield traders to assist them in complying with their legal obligations in respect of the new Food Information Regulations 2014 has also been provided.

In respect of enforcement under the Health & Safety at Work etc Act 1974, it should be noted that there has been a reduction in the level of verbal advice given to traders, market customers and self-employed persons.

Recommendations

I recommend that your Committee notes the content of this report.

Main Report

Background

1. This is the thirty fifth report submitted to your Committee detailing the activities of the Smithfield Enforcement team.
2. The table at Appendix 1 provides a breakdown of Health and Safety enforcement activity for the four month period 1st October 2014 to 31st January 2015. The names of tenants in respect of which warnings were issued have not been included. The table at Appendix 2 shows Health and Safety enforcement activity during the last sixteen months.

Current Position

3. Members will be aware that following a successful bid, the FSA provided funding of £1,590 to the City of London Corporation for the purpose of food sampling at Smithfield Market as part of their 2014/15 National Co-ordinated Sampling Programme. The funding was provided to cover officer costs in obtaining samples. A total of 53 samples were submitted for analysis during the period August 2014 to December 2014 comprising minced meat (37 samples) and uncooked chicken (16 samples). Public analyst costs were funded directly by the FSA.
4. Minced meat samples were taken to determine whether the product had been correctly labelled in terms of its species (12 samples), fat content, connective tissue and collagen/meat protein ratio, descriptions and/or claims (25 samples).
5. In respect of uncooked chicken, the labelling declarations in terms of meat content, added water and hydrolysed proteins were checked.
6. Results have been provided to date by the Public Analyst in respect of 40 samples (27 minced meat and 13 uncooked chicken).
7. One minced meat sample was unsatisfactory in respect of species description. The product had been described as lamb mince which on analysis was found to contain traces of pork. This was thought to be a consequence of cross contamination during the mincing process. Ten further minced meat samples were found to be unsatisfactory due to labelling deficiencies in respect of the percentage values of fat and collagen content not being present on the label contrary to the requirements of The Food Information Regulations 2014.
8. Four chicken samples were unsatisfactory. One due to the price per unit weight not being present on the label contrary to the requirements of The Poultry Meat (England) Regulations 2011 and two because the font size on the label was too small (less than 6mm high) contrary to the requirements of The Weights and

Measures (Packed Goods) Regulations 2006. A further sample was found to be unsatisfactory because the label did not contain the statement 'packed in a protective atmosphere' contrary to the requirements of The Food Additives, Flavourings, Enzymes and Extraction Solvents (England) Regulations 2013.

9. The manufacturers of the unsatisfactory products, the Home Authorities i.e the local authorities that have enforcement responsibility for the producers, and the food business operators on Smithfield market have been advised of the unsatisfactory results.
10. Members should note that the results of all food samples taken by my officers at Smithfield are entered onto the Food Standards Agency's United Kingdom Food Surveillance System (UKFSS) National Food Sampling database.
11. Further results in respect of thirteen samples are awaited. A further update will be provided in the next report to Committee.
12. Members will recall that a further successful bid for funding was made to the FSA in August 2014 for £ 26,000. This was to undertake a 3 month project (October 2014 – January 2015) focusing on food standards and traceability at Smithfield market, and the development of guidance and training on new EU labelling rules to enable Smithfield traders to meet their legal obligations in respect of The Food Information Regulations 2014. Work on any other areas of specific concern to the City of London was also agreed, including continuation of the joint initiative assessing compliance by food delivery vehicles, food labelling compliance and animal by-product controls.
13. During the period October 2014 to January 2015, 43 establishments on Smithfield market were visited to inform the FSA funded project. Food Standards Agency officials accompanied City of London Corporation officers on visits to 10 of the establishments. The findings can be summarised as follows:-
 - Three establishments were found to be non-compliant in respect of Animal by- Product controls. At two of these, 1559 kilos and 1417 kilos respectively of product either unfit for human consumption or past its use-by date were found which had not been identified as Animal by-Product. At another establishment unfit product (5kg) was found in a display cabinet. All of this product was surrendered for disposal.
 - Food labelling contraventions were identified at thirty three establishments. The non-compliances had occurred as a consequence of i) traders splitting large boxes of product where boxes had been labelled but inner packs had not been, ii) the date of first freezing of the product not being applied, iii) product information in a foreign language and iv) product offered for sale beyond its indicated durability date.

- Traceability exercises were carried out at all 43 establishments. Generally, good traceability systems were being maintained with minor improvements required to commercial documentation in some cases.
 - All sixty two food delivery vehicles checked during the period were found to comply with food hygiene legislation.
14. A report will be submitted to the FSA concerning the outcome of the project and will seek guidance on the next steps in obtaining compliance by the traders.
 15. Where non compliances were identified food business operators were informed in writing.
 16. All market traders were provided with detailed guidance produced in conjunction with a consultant from Campden BRI Group to assist them in complying with the new Food Information Regulations 2014. Training is currently being developed to further assist traders which it is anticipated will take place in April 2015.
 17. The Committee should note that in November 2014 the Food Standards Agency issued a consultation document proposing amendments to the Food Law Code of Practice. The proposed amendments will:
 - Revise and clarify arrangements for food establishment registration and inspections of mobile food establishments, ships and aircrafts to remove unnecessary regulatory activity.
 - Revise competency and qualification requirements for local authority officers engaged in official controls and other regulatory activities to better target enforcement resources and ensure greater consistency.
 18. The impact of any amendments to the Code of Practice which are implemented will be reported to a future Committee as necessary.
 19. Members are advised that an Authorised Officer from the Smithfield Enforcement team retired in December 2014. A temporary officer has been employed on a six month fixed term contract pending the outcome of the final stages of the Service Based Review for Markets and Consumer Protection.
 20. Regular liaison meetings continue to take place between City of London Corporation officers and the FSA. Further, City of London Corporation officers and FSA officials meet with the Smithfield Market Traders Association on a regular basis.
 21. During the four month period from October 2014 to January 2015 advice has continued to be provided to traders, customers and self-employed persons under

the Health and Safety at Work etc. Act 1974 with verbal advice being provided on 180 occasions for contraventions such as not wearing personal protective equipment. This is an improvement on the previous reporting period when advice was provided on 243 occasions. It should be noted that of the 180 occasions this period, 10 involved traders, the remainder involved customers (167) and self-employed persons (3).

22. Health and safety enforcement is delivered having regard to the Compliance Code for Regulators and the Port Health and Public Protection Service Enforcement Policy.

Conclusion

23. My officers in the Smithfield Enforcement team continue to work collaboratively with the FSA. FSA funded project work is on target and over the last three reporting periods there has been a reduction in the number of occasions that verbal advice has been provided in respect of health and safety representing improved compliance.

Background Papers:

- Appendix 1: Table showing breakdown of health and safety enforcement activity during the four month period 1 October 2014 – 31 January 2015.
- Appendix 2: Comparison table showing health and safety enforcement activity summary for the period 1 October 2013 – 31 January 2015.

Contact:

Jon Averbs

0207 332 1603

jon.averms@cityoflondon.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

Each company has been allocated a number, so that the above information remains confidential. The number allocated to the company will remain the same in each period, and this will demonstrate whether companies are improving or whether they are continuing to fail to comply with the Regulations.

HEALTH SAFETY ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITY SUMMARY
SMITHFIELD MEAT MARKET - 1 June 2014 to 31 January 2015

The following information shows the breakdown of the enforcement activity. Each company has been allocated a number, so that the information remains confidential. The number that has been allocated to the company remains the same, and this will demonstrate whether companies are improving or whether they are continuing to fail to comply with the Regulations.

Key **A:** **Verbal advice** **C:** **Formal notices**
B: **Written advice** **D:** **Recommended for prosecution**

Stall	Oct 13 to Jan 14				Feb14 to May 14				June 14 to Sept 14				Oct 14 to Jan 15				TOTAL
	A	B	C	D	A	B	C	D	A	B	C	D	A	B	C	D	
1						1			1								2
2					2	1											3
3													1				1
4										1			1				2
5	3								2								5
6	2	1															3
7	1	1							1								3
8	1																1
9																	0
10	2									1			1				4
11																	0
12	1	1			1												3
13																	0
14																	0
15					1												1
16									2								2
17		1															1
18	2								1								3
19		1															1
20									1								1
21													1				1
22					3				1	1							5
23																	0
24		1															1
25																	0
26													1				1
27		1															1
28	5																5
29																	0
30	2					1											3
31	7				3				2				2				14
32	1												2				3
33									1				1				2
34	1	1			4												6
35	1				3				1								5
36	1																1
37	3																3
38	3																3
39																	0
40	6	1							2								9
41																	0
42									1	2							3
43																	0
44	2	1															3
45	4				1												5
46					1				1								2
TOTAL	48	10	0	0	19	3	0	0	17	5	0	0	10	0	0	0	112

This page is intentionally left blank

Agenda Item 6

Committee(s):	Date(s):
Markets	4 March 2015
Subject: Smithfield Market – Condenser Water Cooling System – update	Public
Report of: The City Surveyor (Ref. CS 050/15)	For Information
Summary	
<p>This report provides Members with an update on the performance of Smithfield Markets' Condenser Water Cooling System, which serves Tenants' refrigeration equipment, and the works currently being undertaken to improve the system.</p> <p>The performance of the condenser water cooling system since the last report in January 2015 has been satisfactory with no incidents recorded.</p> <p>Phase 3 of the City's improvement works has been completed, a final inspection of the works has been undertaken, and new filtration equipment is in operation.</p> <p>Following the Phase 3 works, the City had hoped to increase the operating temperature of the system to reduce operating costs and wear to cooling towers. However, in view of comments expressed by the Tenants Association and the terms of the new leases, which require that due regard is paid to the views of the Association, it will not be possible to proceed with this at the present time. The City is preparing a description of operation of the cooling system for review and discussion at a meeting of the 'Joint Specification Committee' in March at which any further actions should be determined. The City will continue to seek agreement to increase the system operating temperature.</p> <p>The City will continue to monitor the system closely, and respond to Tenants' request for advice concerning refrigeration and cooling matters.</p>	
Recommendation(s)	
Members are invited to note the contents of this report.	

Main Report

Background

1. The Market's condenser water cooling system removes waste heat from 120 tenants' refrigeration units in East, West and Poultry Markets and dissipates it to the atmosphere via five cooling towers located in the Poultry Market. The system is operated and maintained by the City Corporation.
2. Over the last five years the City Corporation has been undertaking a programme of works to improve the system in the three Markets. A third phase of the work, aimed at removing dirt contamination carried around the system, has recently been completed.

Current Position

3. The cooling system is currently working well and supplying water to the Tenants' fridge condensers at 20°C. There have been no operating issues to report since the last report in January 2015.
4. The final third phase of the City's improvement programme aimed at removing dirt contamination carried around the system has recently been completed. A final inspection of the works by the City, the Contractor and the City's Consultant (Aecom) took place on 4 February. The new filtration equipment is in service and seen to be capturing dirt in circulation. Photographs of the completed works are included in the Appendix to this report.
5. A proposal to increase the low temperature setting of the system, currently 20°C, in gradual steps to 25°C was discussed by the Superintendent and Property Facilities Manager at a meeting with the Smithfield Market Tenants' Association on 15 January. The City believes the higher temperature would still be sufficient to meet the cooling needs of the fridges, provided these have correctly sized condensers. The City had hoped to commence this trial during cold weather.
6. This proposal would reduce the City's operating costs and reduce wear to cooling tower components. It is difficult to be precise about the extra running costs being incurred, but in hot summer weather, it is felt the additional costs of power, water, salt, chemicals and maintenance may well be in the order of £1,000 a week, and perhaps around £100 a week in winter.
7. However, at the meeting, the Association requested that no change be made to the system without first understanding the conditions under which it is operating and clarification of the available water supply. In view of the terms included in the new leases signed in April 2013, the City agreed to this. It was also requested that an update of the Refrigeration Expert's report provided in 2011 be commissioned to comment on the system's fitness for purpose for both current and future needs.

8. The new leases include the obligation that '.....the landlords will provide sufficient volume and temperature of condenser water subject to prior consultation with and having due regard to the views of the Association.....'
9. At the request of the Superintendent, the City Surveyor's Principal Engineer is drafting a written description of the operation of the system detailing its current state and the historical background. It is anticipated that a formal meeting of the 'Joint Specification Committee' will then be convened in March to review the description and decide what further action should be taken.
10. No further fridge condensers have been replaced with updated units by Tenants since the last report. The City has been advised two more condensers will be replaced shortly.
11. Since the last report one further meeting with a Tenant has taken place, on 10 February 2015. A report on this is given in the Non-Public Annex.

Proposals

12. The City will provide the description of operation of the cooling system requested by the Tenants Association. It is anticipated that a formal meeting of the 'Joint Specification Committee' will then be convened in March and any further actions determined. The terms of reference for any updated report required by the Refrigeration Expert will be agreed.
13. The City will continue to seek agreement to increase the system operating temperature.
14. Further replacements of fridge condensers by Tenants' contractors will be monitored and encouraged. The replacement of undersized fridge condensers will address historic problems with stall temperatures.

Corporate & Strategic Implications

15. The system supports the following Strategic Aims:
 - To provide modern, efficient and high quality local services and policing within the Square Mile for workers, residents and visitors with a view to delivering sustainable outcomes.
 - To provide valued services to London and the nation.

Implications

16. The cooling system operated by the City provides a critical service for Tenants' refrigeration equipment. A failure of the system could expose the City to claims for loss or damage suffered by tenants if refrigeration equipment broke down as a result.
17. In line with the new leases, the City will give "due regard" to any logical and factual views put forward by the Tenants' Association. In respect of the system operating temperature, the City believes the higher temperature would

still be sufficient to meet the heat rejection of the fridges, provided these have correctly sized condensers, whilst achieving significant savings in operating costs, and reducing wear to cooling tower components.

Conclusion

18. The performance of the condenser water cooling system since the last report in January has been satisfactory.
19. Phase 3 of the City's improvement works has been completed, a final inspection of the works has been undertaken, and the new filtration equipment is in operation.
20. Whilst the City would have liked to increase the system operating temperature under a trial, in view of comments expressed by the Tenants Association and the terms of the new leases, it will not be possible to proceed with this at the present time. The City is preparing a description of operation of the cooling system for review and if required discussion at a meeting of the 'Joint Specification Committee'. This should determine the next actions.
21. The City will continue to monitor the system closely, and respond to Tenants' request for advice concerning refrigeration and cooling matters.

Background Papers:

Report of the City Surveyor (ref CS014/15) dated January 2015 to Markets Committee: 'Smithfield Market – Condenser Water Cooling System - update'

Appendix 1:

Photographs of the completed Phase 3 improvement works

Andrew Crafter

Principal Mechanical Engineer, Operations Group, City Surveyor's Department

T: 020 7332 1252

E: Andrew.Crafter@Cityoflondon.gov.uk

Appendix 1: Photographs of the completed Phase 3 improvement works



New duplex strainer units serving North West and South West fridge decks. The dirt collection baskets within each can be inspected and emptied without interrupting the flow to the fridges.



New sidestream filtration unit. This is a cyclone type cleaner; dirt collects in a bag within the container on the right and requires periodic emptying. The green pump seen at the rear is one of the two main cooling tower pumps.



New duplex strainer and (top left) electronic flow meter serving Poultry Market. The flow meter is linked to the City's Building Management System, allowing the flow rate to be monitored and recorded continuously. There are separate meters for East and West Markets.

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A
of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

This page is intentionally left blank